## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS HOUSTON DIVISION

CONNECTICUT GENERAL LIFE	§	
INSURANCE COMPANY AND	§	
CIGNA HEALTH AND LIFE	§	
INSURANCE COMPANY	§	
	§	JURY DEMANDED
Plaintiff,	§	
	§	
VS.	§	CIVIL ACTION NO.: 4:13-CV-3291
	§	
HUMBLE SURGICAL HOSPITAL, LLC	§	
	§	
Defendant.	§	

## HUMBLE SURGICAL HOSPITAL, LLC'S NOTICE OF EXPERT UPDATE

Humble submits this notice to the Court of an update to its expert's model of benefits due Humble for Cigna's unjustified refusal to pay claims.

On January 20, 2016, Humble's expert Charlotte Kohler testified regarding her calculation of the amount of unpaid benefits due Humble in this case. Ms. Kohler presented a model, her Allowables Model, that successfully reconstructs the "but-for" world that would have existed had Cigna not improvidently flagged Humble as a fee-forgiver in December 2011.

As part of her Allowables Model, Ms. Kohler determined the appropriate allowable amounts for claims based on the governing plans and whether those claims and plans were subject to negotiation. Ms. Kohler divided Humble's 595 claims into separate categories, or "buckets," based on how the allowable amounts of each claims would have been determined by Cigna in the but-for world.

Cigna, however, failed to produce plans governing 49 of Humble's 595 Pursued Claims. Humble requested the missing plans on Monday, January 18, 2016. Exhibit 1 (Lahad email).

During trial on January 19, 2016, counsel for Cigna represented that Cigna needed plan years in order to produce the missing plans. 01/19/16 Trial Tr. at 2:4-7. Humble provided plan years the same day. Exhibit 2 (Lahad email).

Cigna produced plans covering 23 of the 49 claims on February 2, 2015. Ms. Kohler has reviewed the additional plans and has updated her benefits-due model. The net result is a decrease of \$26,394 in the amount of benefits due HSH to \$11,365,878.58. Ms. Kohler's brief update and supporting data are attached as Exhibit 3. These results support the validity of Ms. Kohler's model as the most accurate approximation of the but-for world.

Humble requested the remaining unproduced plans on February 9, 2016, but has heard nothing from Cigna. Exhibit 4 (Lahad email). Should Cigna produce the remaining plans, Humble and its expert reserve the right to further update the amount of benefits due Humble.

Dated: February 17, 2016 Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ John Lahad

Brian D. Melton

Southern District of Texas No. 26016

State Bar No. 24010620

bmelton@susmangodfrey.com

Jonathan J. Ross

Southern District of Texas No. 18293

State Bar No. 00791575

jross@susmangodfrey.com

Chanler A. Langham

Southern District of Texas No. 659756

State Bar No. 24053314

clangham@susmangodfrey.com

John P. Lahad

Southern District of Texas No. 1114929

State Bar No. 24068095

ilahad@susmangodfrey.com

Aimee Vidaurri

Southern District of Texas No. 2781826

State Bar No. 24098550

avidaurri@susmangodfrey.com

SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P. 1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 5100 Houston, Texas 77002 Telephone: (713) 651-9366 Facsimile: (713) 654-6666

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT HUMBLE SURGICAL HOSPITAL LLC

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

This is to certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing document has been served on the undersigned counsel via email on the 17th day of February, 2016:

John B. Shely
Dena Palermo
Brian Pidcock
Laura Trenaman
ANDREWS KURTH LLP
600 Travis Street, Suite 4200
Houston, Texas 77002
(713) 220-4152
(713) 238-7206 fax

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

/s/ John Lahad	
/S/ JOHN Lanaa	